



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
E-MAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

**PLANNING COMMITTEE
MEETING OF NOVEMBER 13, 2009
MINUTES**

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Adrienne J. Tissier, Vice Chair
San Mateo County

Tom Azumbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

Dean J. Chu
Cities of Santa Clara County

Dave Cortese
Association of Bay Area Governments

Chris Daly
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sue Lempert
Cities of San Mateo County

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Jon Rubin
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Amy Rein Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Ken Yeager
Santa Clara County

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

ATTENDANCE

Commissioner Spering called the Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Other members in attendance were Commissioners Giacomini, Haggerty, Lempert, Mackenzie, Rein-Worth, Rubin, and Yeager. Commissioners Bates, Cortese, and Daly also attended.

CONSENT CALENDAR: Minutes of September 11, 2009

Commissioner Mackenzie moved approval, Commissioner Rein-Worth seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Follow-Up

Ms. Jennifer Yeamans provided an update on two follow-up actions identified in the Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Report a sought Committee comments on: (a) snapshot analysis methodology and (b) results of a regional housing and transportation affordability study.

Ms. Randi Kinman, MCAC, reported on MCAC's role and their thoughts on the process.

Committee Comments:

- Commissioner Cortese asked how MTC influences CMA decisions once the analysis has been done and the criteria have been established? Response: The goal is to have the information readily available for any person or agency that can use it to make planning or investment decisions.
- Commissioner Yeager asked if it would be helpful to look at the bus lines that local transportation agencies are cutting? Is MTC finding that the lines that are being cut are in the areas of concern? Response: Staff is able to show year over year the change in the level of transit service in a given area, which staff gets from the 511 database. Ms. Kinman stated that one of the things they have been looking at is the difference between regional averages for transit supply and local averages. Mr. Steve Heminger stated that both MTC and transit operators are required, under Title VI of the Federal Civil Rights Act, to perform specific analyses related to where communities of concern are and how they are affected by transportation decisions. When transit agencies make decisions about specific routes they have their own Title VI obligations, and are required to evaluate whether the cuts they are doing result in any kind of disproportionate impact. Staff depends on the transit operators to carry out that part of their Title VI responsibility.

- Commissioner Spring asked where do the other choices, such as taxis, get factored into this formula? Response: Ms. Yeamans stated that that looking at such alternatives may be part of the work that will be undertaken in the Transit Sustainability Project. He noted that it would be nice to have a regional approach to some of these solutions.
- Commissioner Mackenzie stated that he would like to see a map that displays sub-regional housing and transportation affordability.
- Commissioner Rein-Worth requested to have a staff contact to get the maps in a way they need to use them. She noted that it would be helpful to have some clear data on origins and destinations. She would like to know where people are living, where they are working, and their work hours. She also asked how people travel by mode. What is the bike accident rate - would like to see regional and local averages. Many of the communities are impacted by air emissions – staff needs to look at that.
- Commissioner Lempert encouraged a larger percentage of affordable housing units in TODs as part of Station Area Planning processes. She also noted that some communities, such as East Palo Alto, only have access to buses and are not in close proximity to rail.
- Commissioner Spring asked if staff has conducted surveys of low-income households? Are they willing to live in high-density developments? What kind of input are we getting from them? Response: Ms. Yeamans stated that staff has various data sources where income can be broken down to answer those questions, but more research could be done specific to attitudes and preferences as part of our upcoming 2010 Bay Area Travel Survey.
- Commissioner Daly commented on the RTP performance objective to reduce the share of income spent on housing and transportation costs by 10 percentage points. He asked if staff is planning on addressing that through transportation pricing or housing pricing as well? Response: Mr. Heminger stated that MTC can no longer address these questions separately. MTC and ABAG will work on those subjects together as part of the SB 375 Sustainable Communities Strategy.
- Commissioner Mackenzie stated that people of lower income in Rohnert Park have no choice but to use an auto to get where they have to go.

Public comment:

Mr. Bob Allen, Urban Habitat, stated that he has always envisioned the Snapshot Analysis to be something you can access on the web. One should be able to click on a neighborhood and all the tabular data would appear showing all the statistics behind what's embedded on the map. As far as measuring affordability, he encouraged staff to look at the website www.bayareaburden.org.

OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 10:25 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, December 11, 2009 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.